

Music Performance Research Copyright © 2012 Royal Northern College of Music Vol. 5, including CMPCP / PSN Special Issue 49-58 ISSN 1755-9219

# The performance of affect in recitativo semplice

# Alan Maddox University of Sydney, Australia

ABSTRACT: Performance practice for seventeenth- and eighteenth-century recitativo semplice remains problematical as it was so sketchily captured in notation, leaving many elements to the discretion of the performers. The literature on declamation provides a practical model for recitative delivery, however: spoken oratory according to the discipline of rhetoric. When recitative is read in the way suggested by contemporary sources, not as 'music' but as musically elaborated declamation, it becomes apparent that a performer of recitative has available all of the rhetorical resources of spoken declamation to express the meaning and affect of the words, including variation of rhythm, pacing, timbre, articulation, emphasis and pitch inflection. While the notation of simple recitative gives much less obvious clues to expression than does the notation of an aria, affect can nevertheless be deduced from the words and from musical cues, particularly relating to vocal tessitura and the harmonic tension encoded in the continuo. The expressive range of declamation is then dictated by the objectives of dramatic verisimilitude, constrained and directed by the principles of rhetorical decorum. Analysis of the words and music of a scene from Handel's Tamerlano demonstrates a historically informed approach to the delivery of recitativo semplice according to rhetorical precepts.

KEY WORDS: Recitative, rhetoric, opera, Tamerlano

# **RECITATIVE AND AFFECT**

In the case of Italian opera between the late seventeenth and late eighteenth centuries, the power of music to move the passions has generally been understood as being located primarily in the arias, with their overtly expressive vocal melodies, usually reinforced by

orchestral accompaniment. A corollary of this is that the more speech-like *recitativo semplice* (simple, or 'secco' recitative), in which the bulk of the dialogue is set, may tend to be read as comparatively neutral in affect. And even when singers do intend to invest the recitatives with affective expression, the lack of clear guidelines for recitative delivery in the primary and secondary literature on historical singing means that this is necessarily done on the basis of limited information about what might constitute appropriate expressive parameters. A broader reading of historical sources can, however, provide some insight into the ways in which seventeenth- and eighteenth-century singers may have used their voices to deliver *recitativo semplice*, a dramatically vital but often musically neglected genre which, after all, made up a large part of almost every Italian opera of the period. Indeed, the historical evidence suggests that early modern singers were expected to express a wide range of affect in simple recitative, and that they did so within a framework of widely understood rhetorical principles.

It is important at the outset to note that singers generally did not work from the neatly copied full-score manuscripts which make up the vast majority of opera scores surviving from this period, much less the kinds of carefully edited, printed scores familiar to modern singers. Instead, they normally worked from quickly copied part-books which contained only the notes and words of their own part, with a (usually unfigured) continuo bass line. Even in complex dialogue scenes, only the most minimal verbal cues from other characters' roles were generally provided. In both full scores and part-books, expressive markings such as notated indications of dynamics, articulation or phrasing, tempo or vocal timbre are entirely absent.<sup>1</sup>

It is thus tempting to assume that music which lacks the kinds of intrinsic musical features which modern musicians and audiences are used to associating with emotional expression – memorable melody, regular rhythm, goal-oriented harmony – and without any of the 'expressive markings' familiar from later vocal scores is not intended to be delivered in a way which expresses emotion. And even if one takes the view that despite the lack of overt musical cues to affect in the score, recitative performance should express the passions embedded in the libretto, the sparse notation of the manuscripts of this period provides little to go on. Of course, few would argue now that the notation of any music can be taken entirely at face value, least of all this kind of sketchy blueprint. But even if we do understand that it is necessary to go beyond 'the dots on the page', in the absence of any other information about how to interpret the score the only alternative seems to be a performance based largely on intuitive 'feel' for the meaning of the words and the composed musical shapes. So, how can we know how vocal expression was managed in recitative? What parameters could be varied and within what boundaries?

# **RECITATIVE AS DECLAMATION**

The root of this dilemma, it seems to me, lies in the way recitative is understood as a genre, for, although it is written out in music notation, recitative lacks many of the features associated with 'music' as conventionally understood in the common practice period, such as a memorable melody or metrically structured rhythm with a regular beat. Instead, it

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> One example which stands out as the 'exception which proves the rule' is Davide Perez's *Solimano* (1757), which includes a number of performance directions for affective delivery. See Jackson (1967), p. 276.

makes more sense to think of it in the way suggested by Giambattista Mancini. Writing in 1777, he summed up an approach to recitative delivery which was implicit, if not so clearly spelled out, in earlier writings on the subject:

Attenti pure al discorso d'un buon Oratore, e sentire quante pose, quante varietà di voci, quante diverse forze adopra per esprimere i suoi sensi; ora innalza la voce, or l'abbassa, or l'affretta, or l'incrudisce, ed or la fa dolce, secondo le diverse passioni, che intende muovere nell'uditore...

Sono essi, che rovinano, e malconciano i recitativi, perchè non vogliono darsi la pena di apprendere le regole della perfetta declamazione (Mancini, 1777, pp. 218, 231).

Listen to the speech of a good orator, and hear how many rests, what variety of tones, how many different emphases he uses to express its meanings. Now he raises his voice, now he lowers it; now he hurries a bit, now he grows harsh and now gentle, according to the various passions that he wishes to stir in the listener...

There are some who beat and batter the recitatives because they will not take the trouble to learn the rules of perfect declamation (trans. W. Allanbrook in Treitler, 1998, p. 871).

Mancini's formulation suggests that it may be most useful to conceptualize the notation of eighteenth-century recitative in a way that reflects its origins almost two centuries earlier, as musically elaborated declamation. It may be thought of, in other words, not as a kind of reduced song, but as a heavily annotated play script, with the pitch contour of the voice sketched out, a rough indication of rhythm notated, and some flexibly improvised backing chords to guide the singer around the specified pitch contours and to intensify the expression of the words.

From an outsider's perspective, Italian recitative did in fact seem very speech-like. According to the French commentator François Raguenet,

[The Italians'] Recitative is little better than downright speaking [ils ne sont, pour ainsi dire, que parler dans leur Recitatif]...; and yet ... they have such an extraordinary Genius for Composition, that they know how to adapt charming Concords, even to a Voice that do's little more than Speak [même au son de la voix d'une personne qui parle simplement sans chanter] (Raguenet, 1702; trans. from Raguenet, 1709, pp. 35-36).

If that is the case, the most useful model for the delivery of recitative is theatrical declamation, which throughout the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries was done according to well-established rhetorical precepts set out by writers including Leone de' Sommi (1567), Andrea Perrucci (1699) and Luigi Riccoboni (1728) (Sommi, 1968; Perrucci, 2008; Riccoboni, 1728). This way of understanding recitative leads away from the idea of 'singing' it and more in the direction of speech-like delivery – something musically and technically challenging for many singers, but an approach which brings consciously into play all of the rhetorical resources of spoken declamation to express the affect of the words. In doing so, it provides a coherent framework for filling in precisely the expressive features of vocal delivery missing from the musical notation of recitative, including pacing, loudness, emphasis, articulation and tone of voice, as well as for aspects only approximately indicated, particularly the rhythm. As Francesco Algarotti noted, in recitative "there are certain suspensions of the voice, certain short pauses, and a certain insisting on one place more than on another, that cannot be communicated, and are therefore resigned over to [the singer's] sagacity and discretion" (Algarotti, 1767, p. 53).

#### AFFECTIVE DELIVERY IN A SCENE FROM HANDEL'S TAMERLANO

I have explored elsewhere some of the specific expressive resources for recitative delivery that can be deduced from the early modern rhetorical literature, including rhetorical principles governing the management of volume, tone, pacing and so on (Maddox, 2005, 2006, 2009). The intention of what follows is to take this a step further by examining some ways in which these expressive resources may have been deployed by early modern singers for the expression of specific affections, using as a case study a particularly dramatic passage of simple recitative from Act III, Scene 1 of Handel's *Tamerlano*.<sup>2</sup> Cues to appropriate (that is, 'decorous') affective expression are encoded in both the verbal and the musical texts of the scene, and when read with an understanding of both verbal rhetoric and musical signification, these cues indicate what kind of affective expression (or at least, what possible range of affective expression) may have been considered appropriate in performance.

Let us begin with the words of the opening dialogue.

ATTO TERZO Scena 1

Cortile del seraglio, in cui sono custoditi

BAJAZETE, ed ASTERIA!

**BAJAZETE** 

Figlia, siam rei, io di schernito sdegno,

tu d'amore sprezzato; vorrà il nostro nemico

vendicarsi dell'uno e placar l'altra.

**ASTERIA** 

Tutta la colpa mia

è una vendetta che ha fallito il segno.

**BAJAZETE** 

Se il Tartaro irritato pensasse a nuovi oltraggi?

a me nulla più resta oltre la vita;

ma a te... ASTERIA

La scampo, oh genitor, m'addita!

**BAJAZETE** 

Odi dunque, ma tutta a incontrarlo

Ci vuol la tua virtude.

**ASTERIA** 

S'è morte, sia la mia, ma non la vostra.

BAJAZETE La tua e la mia. Vedi, quest'è veleno,

de'miei vasti tesori unico avanzo; ...

ACT THREE

Courtyard of the seraglio in which BAJAZET and ASTERIA

are imprisoned.

**BAJAZET** 

Daughter, we are guilty, I of deriding his rage,

you of rejecting his love; our enemy will want to have

revenge for the one and to appease the other.

ASTERIA My entire fault

is in attempting revenge which missed its mark.

**BAJAZET** 

But if the angry Tartar devised new outrages?

Nothing remains to me but my life;

but for you... ASTERIA

Father, show me how we can escape!

**BAJAZET** 

Listen, then, but to face it will require all your courage.

ASTERIA

If it is death, let it be mine, but not yours.

BAJAZET
Yours and mine.
See, this is poison,

all that remains of my vast treasures; ...

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The conference presentation from which this article was derived compared aspects of three recordings of the opera: Nigel Rogers (Bajazet), with English Baroque Soloists and John Eliot Gardiner (Erato: 2292-45408-2; CD, 1987); Tom Randle (Bajazet), English Concert Orchestra and Trevor Pinnock (Arthaus Musik: 100 702; DVD, 2001); and Placido Domingo (Bajazet), Teatro Real, Madrid and Paul McCreesh (Opus Arte: OA 1006 D; DVD, 2009).

As with the libretti of Metastasio and other contemporary poets, Agostino Piovene's libretto for *Tamerlano* is written in *versi sciolti*, made up of mixed seven- and eleven-syllable lines,<sup>3</sup> in which the poetry is elaborated with rhetorical figures expressing *affetti* (emotional states) and *concetti* (thoughts or ideas). These *affetti* and *concetti* can be systematically identified in the verbal text, which provides a starting point for deciding on appropriate ways to convey each affection most effectively with the voice in performance. For instance, within the four lines of Bajazet's opening speech there is a series of overtly affective key words and concepts, some of which are set out in contrasting pairs, an example of the rhetorical device of *opposto*:

- rei
- schernito sdegno / amore sprezzato
- nemico
- vendicarsi / placar.

Having identified these affetti and concetti, a singer could now apply the resources of rhetorical declamation, including the manipulation of timing, volume, articulation, sonority and tone colour, to powerfully express them. But decisions about how to apply these resources depended not only on knowing the technical skills of theatrical declamation: the singer also needed to understand the encompassing principles of rhetorical delivery, particularly those of decorum (appropriateness to the dramatic situation), kairos (matching the message to the circumstances), ethos (projecting the speaker's character) and audience (who is being addressed, both on stage and in the auditorium). For example, how was a performer to convey powerful emotions against the background expectation of reserved aristocratic 'cool' which is essential to the ethos of serious characters in dramma per musica? This delicate balance requires an understanding of the dramatic context, including aristocratic social relations and gender roles both as they were understood in the daily interactions of early modern society and in the fictional scenario of the drama. It was for this reason that Mancini advised singers to study history and mythology in order to effectively represent well-known characters on stage (Mancini, 1777, pp. 220-222). A skilful performer also needed to understand, and to be able to identify and exploit, the rhetorical conventions of poetic composition, including not only the use of key affective words, but also devices such as opposto (above), verbal gestures of introduction and conclusion, and figures of repetition and imitation.

Returning to *Tamerlano*, how might a singer apply these rhetorical principles in performing the role of Bajazet? At face value, it may appear difficult not to make the imprisoned Turkish emperor's relentless haughtiness, rage and concern for his honour throughout the opera comical or pathetic. But when this scene is read in terms of the cumulative tension of the dramatic situation (*kairos*), Bajazet's aristocratic status and warlike character (*ethos*), and the audience he is addressing (his daughter Asteria on the stage, and the upper stratum of English society in the auditorium), it is possible to discern some appropriate (or, in rhetorical terms, 'decorous') ways of deploying a singer's vocal resources to express the intense passions written into the libretto. A preliminary list of

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The rather complex provenance of the libretto is untangled by Dean and Knapp (1995), pp. 532-537.

qualities suitable for Bajazet's delivery in this scene might then look something like the following:

- Ethos: Bajazet will be vigorous and firm without appearing coarse, concerned for his daughter without being sentimental, sorrowful without being self-pitying, and, above all, never out of control.
- **Pacing:** The pacing of his delivery should therefore be lively and declamatory in keeping with the powerful affections expressed, but measured, in accordance with his aristocratic demeanour.
- **Dynamic:** His volume should be medium-loud, expressing his fearless resolution to die, but moderated by the dramatic circumstances (*kairos*): he and Asteria are imprisoned in the harem, surrounded by guards who might overhear their conversation and prevent their suicide plan.
- **Timbre:** His basic tone should be firm and bright to characterize both his regal bearing and his fearless resolution, but also darkened at the climax of the scene to create the atmosphere of suppressed or whispered conversation perhaps a classic instance for 'chiaroscuro' vocal sound.
- Articulation: The first Virtue of rhetorical delivery in any circumstance was the absolute requirement for the words to be clear and comprehensible (perspicuitas). When setting out his plan to take poison, Bajazet's articulation should be particularly clear and marked to show his determination, and can be intensified by using the opportunity written into the libretto to emphasize the strong sonority of the initial consonant in "veleno" (poison). When expressing concern for Asteria ("ma a te..."), on the other hand, articulation would be smoother, the volume a little softer and the tone more soft-edged, making use of the warm sonority of "ma", and the 'sonorous and sweet' consonant on "te" (Maddox, 2009; Tesauro, 1670, p. 163).

Turning now to the score, it is worth noting that accommodating speech to the musical notation of recitative involves some compromise in rhythm compared with spoken declamation, and an even larger constraint with regard to pitch (since this is specified by the composer), but it does provide a 'payoff' for accommodating these constraints. Compared with spoken recitation, the benefits of musical delivery in the form of recitative include:

- relatively seamless integration of dialogue with the arias and other musical numbers
- written-in clues to the composer's conception of meaning (including affect), encoded in the notated pitch, rhythm and harmony.

For instance, Girolamo Mei, the humanist scholar whose research lay behind the development of early monody, drew on Quintilian to explain the significance of pitch in declamation:<sup>4</sup>

pitches intermediate between the extremely high and the extremely low are appropriate

54

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Mei's formulation was in turn followed by later writers from Doni (1630/1763) to Mancini (1777).

for showing a quiet and moderate disposition of the affections, while the very high are signs of a very excited and uplifted spirit, and the very low of abject and humble thoughts (Mei, 1989, pp. 58-59).

As with the words, these cues to meaning and affect can be systematically identified in the musical text. For instance, if we start by looking for clues in the way Handel set the affective words identified in the libretto above, it is apparent that there are some clear signifiers built into the pitch contour and tessitura of both voice and continuo bass (see Figure 1). For example, points of higher or lower pitch coincide with affective words (falling pitch on *rei* [bar 1], leap up to *sdegno* [bar 2] and scalic rise to high pitch on *irritato* [bar 9]), as do opportunities for dissonant appoggiaturas against the continuo harmonisation (*sdegno* [bar 2], *sprezzato* [bar 3]).



**Figure 1.** Handel, *Tamerlano*. Act III, Scene 1, bars 1-12. (Cortile del seraglio, in cui sono custoditi Bajazete, ed Asteria; courtyard of the seraglio in which Bajazet and Asteria are imprisoned.)<sup>5</sup>

Even if the notated rhythm is realized flexibly, in compromise with the expressive declamatory rhythm which the singer/actor finds in the libretto, Handel's rhythmic notation is not to be disregarded, a striking example in this passage being the use of rests to dramatize the breathless seriousness of Bajazet's talk of a suicide pact at "la tua e la mia."

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Suggested appoggiaturas are shown in small type. These include both obligatory cadential appoggiaturas (e.g. bars 1, 6 and 8) and examples of expressive appoggiaturas which can heighten the intensity of key affective words and dissonant harmonies (e.g. bars 2, 3, 4 and 9).

Vedi: quest'è veleno..." (see Figure 2).

The harmony, too, provides flexible, non-verbal reinforcement of the voice part through patterns of harmonic tension and release which can be further highlighted by the harpsichordist through manipulation of voicing and texture. Harmonic movement can also provide variations in momentum and intensity, for instance by contrasting moments of stasis with increasingly directional movement towards a poetic climax, and sometimes through salient manipulation of key area. While it is beyond the scope of this paper to analyse the role of the continuo in any detail, a few obvious examples of its role in reinforcing the musical subtext, which in turn can inform the singer's delivery, include the following:

- the dissonant chord on *sdegno* (bar 2; Figure 1)
- the lack of harmonic movement which maintains the dramatic tension at the scene's climax "Vedi: quest'è veleno..." (bar 21; Figure 2)
- a striking harmonic shift to the flat tonal area as Bajazet's agitation grows at the thought of his own and his daughter's deaths, a disruption to the natural order illustrated by the modulation extending as far as A flat minor at bar 46 (see Figure 3). This powerful passage is unfortunately cut from many performances of this scene.



Figure 2. Handel, Tamerlano. Act III, Scene 1, bars 18-24.



Figure 3. Handel, *Tamerlano*. Act III, Scene 1, bars 40-47.

### **CONCLUSION**

It is, of course, no surprise to find that key points of musical intensity typically coincide with the points of verbal intensity indicated by affective words, but the larger issues that follow from this analysis include the questions of how these devices could be used to paint Bajazet's character more generally throughout the opera, and how singers in very different dramatic scenarios might have projected the affective devices encoded in libretto and score. It seems to me that if good singers identified salient affective clues in the words and musical notation, the expressive range of their declamation would then have been dictated by the objectives of dramatic verisimilitude, constrained and directed by the encompassing principle of decorum.

How might such an understanding be applied in performance today? Good singer-actors may interpret the words and musical score intuitively, but it is difficult to do this consistently well purely on the basis of intuition. Pier Francesco Tosi made clear how easy it is to get it wrong:

[Some singers] through trying too hard make a barking sound; some [sing it] as if telling a secret... some do not understand it, and some do not make it understood: some as if begging, some disdainful; some speak it dopily, and some devour it: some sing it through the teeth, and others with affectation; some do not pronounce it, and some do not express it; some laugh it, and some cry it; some speak it, and some hiss it; some shriek, some shout... (Tosi, 1723).<sup>6</sup>

The model briefly outlined here moves some way towards a systematic method for reading affective expression in recitative, and suggests some tools for delivering it meaningfully in performance. That emotional meaning may of course not be identical for modern audiences to that experienced by historical ones, but understanding as well as we can how the performance of recitative in *dramma per musica* was conceived when it was new provides a plausible basis for bringing it to life in the theatre today.

#### **REFERENCES**

Algarotti, F. (1767). *An essay on the opera written in Italian by Count Algarotti...* London: printed for L. Davis and C. Reymers.

Dean, W. & Knapp, J. M. (1995). *Handel's operas, 1704-1726* (Rev. ed.). Oxford & New York: Clarendon Press.

Doni, G. B. (1763). Trattato della musica scenica (1630). In A. F. Gori & G. B. Passeri (Eds.), *Lyra barberina amphichordos* (Vol. II, pp. 1-144). Florence: Nella Stamperia Imperiale.

Jackson, P. (1967). The operas of David Perez. Unpublished PhD thesis, Stanford University.

Maddox, A. (2005). Singing to the ear and to the heart: performance practice and the rhetorical tradition in early and mid eighteenth-century Italian vocal music. In *Passion, Affekt und Leidenschaft in der frühen Neuzeit: 11. Jahrestreffen des Wolfenbütteler Arbeitskreises für Barockforschung, 2-*5 April 2003. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag.

Maddox, A. (2006). "On the knowledge necessary for one who wishes to recite well in the theatre": the rhetorical tradition of delivery and the performance practice of

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> My translation, based on Tosi (1743, pp. 69-70).

- recitativo semplice in eighteenth-century dramma per musica. Unpublished PhD thesis, University of Sydney.
- Maddox, A. (2009). Rhetoric as a guide to vocal timbre and sonority in Italian recitative. In E. Mackinlay, B. L. Bartleet & K. Barney (Eds.), *Musical islands: exploring connections between music, place and research*. Cambridge: Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
- Mancini, G. (1777). Riflessioni pratiche sul canto figurato. Milano: Giuseppe Galeazzi.
- Mei, G. (1989). Letter to Vincenzo Galilei, 8 May 1572. In C. Palisca (Ed.), *The Florentine camerata: documentary studies and translations* (pp. 56-75). New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Perrucci, A. (2008). A treatise on acting, from memory and by improvisation (1699): Dell'arte rappresentativa, premeditata ed all'improviso. Trans. and ed. Francesco Cotticelli, Anne Goodrich Heck & Thomas F. Heck. Lanham, MD: Scarecrow Press.
- Raguenet, F. (1702). Parallèlle des italiens et des français. Paris: J. Moreau.
- Raguenet, F. (1709). Comparison between the French and Italian musick and opera's.

  Translated from the French; with some remarks. To which is added a critical discourse upon opera's in England, and a means proposed for their improvement. London: Printed for W. Lewis.
- Riccoboni, L. (1728). Dell'arte rappresentativa: Capitoli sei. London: [n.p.].
- Sommi, L. D. (1968). *Quattro dialoghi in materia di rappresentazioni sceniche: a cura di ferrucio marotti.* Milano: Edizioni Il Polifilo.
- Tesauro, E. S. J. (1670). Il cannocchiale aristotelico, o sia, idea dell'arguta et ingegniosa elocutione, che serve à tutta l'arte oratoria, lapidaria; et simbolica. Esaminata co'principij del divino Aristotele, dal Conte & Cavalier Gran Croce D. Emanuele Tesauro, patritio torinese. Quinta impressione. Torino: Bartolomeo Zavatta.
- Tosi, P. F. (1723). Opinioni de'cantori antichi, e moderni o sieno osservazioni sopra il canto figurato. Bologna: L. dalla Volpe.
- Tosi, P. F. (1743). Observations on the florid song, or, sentiments on the ancient and modern singers. Written in Italian by Pier Francesco Tosi, of the Phil-Harmonic Academy at Bologna. Translated into English by Mr. Galliard (2nd ed.). London: J. Wilcox.
- Treitler, L. (Ed.). (1998). *Strunk's source readings in music history* (Rev. ed.). New York: Norton.

**Alan Maddox** is a Lecturer in Musicology at the University of Sydney. His research focuses on rhetoric in early modern vocal music, and on Australian colonial music. He is also musicologist to the Australian Brandenburg Orchestra, and Associate Investigator with the Australian Research Council Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions.